

COUNTY OF KAUAI
Minutes of Meeting
OPEN SESSION

Board/Commission	Kaua'i Fire Commission	Meeting Date	July 1, 2019
Location	Mo`ikeha Building – Meeting Room 2A/B	Start of Meeting: 2:00 p.m.	End of Meeting: 3:25 p.m.
Present	Chair Chad Pacheco; Vice Chair Linda Kaauwai-Iwamoto; Jen Chahanovich, Alfredo Garces Jr., Alfred Levinthol and Michael Martinez. Also present: Board & Commissions Office Staff: Support Clerk Mercedes Omo; Administrator Ellen Ching; Office of the County Attorney: Deputy County Attorney Cameron Takamura; Fire Department: Deputy Chief Kilipaki Vaughan; Assistant Fire Chief Mike Scovel; Fire/Ocean Safety Employees of the Month: Accountant I Yolanda Gomez-Cummings and Program Support Technician Lauryn Duterte; Executive Secretary Soncy Tamashiro, Fire Secretary Debbie Gatioan; Administrative Officer Kathy Tanita, Summer Intern Celeste Aiu and Off-duty Fire Captain Tracy Cummings. Public testimony: Ms. Felicia Cowden.		
Excused	Commissioner Thomas Nizo		



SUBJECT	DISCUSSION	ACTION
Call To Order		Chair Pacheco called the meeting to order at 2:00 p.m. with six members present to conduct business.
Chair's Comments/ Announcement	Next regular monthly meeting – 2 p.m. Monday, August 5, 2019 at the Mō`ikeha Building, Meeting Room 2A/2B.	
Approval of Minutes	Chair Pacheco called for two separate motions, the first motion was to approve or amend the Regular Open Session Minutes and second was to approve or amend the Regular Executive Session meeting minutes of June 3, 2019.	Vice Chair Kaauwai-Iwamoto moved to approve the Open Session meeting minutes of June 3, 2019 as circulated. Mr. Levinthol seconded the motion. Motion carried 6:0. Ms. Chahanovich moved to approve the Executive

SUBJECT	DISCUSSION	ACTION
		<p>Session meeting minutes of June 3, 2019 as circulated. Vice Chair Kaauwai-Iwamoto seconded the motion. The ayes have it and the motion carried 6:0.</p>
<p>June Employees of the Month Recognition</p>	<p>Deputy Fire Chief Vaughan presented the Mānā Kako`o Kinaiahi Certificate of Appreciation to Yolanda Gomez-Cummings and the Mānā Kako`o Kia`i Kai Certificate of Appreciation to Lauryn Duterte. He commended them for not just for being an integral part of the organization, but for their willingness to go beyond their normal job duties to assist the Department with other essential tasks.</p> <p>Chair Pacheco along with Commissioners Chahanovich, Iwamoto, Garces, Levinthol and Martinez commended the ladies for hard work and dedication which earned them the right to be named the Kaua`i Fire Department`s Employees of the Month for June 2019.</p> <p>Ms. Gomez and Ms. Duterte expressed their heartfelt appreciation to Deputy Fire Chief Kilipaki Vaughan and the entire Kaua`i Fire Department organization for the honor of being named the Kaua`i Fire Department Employees of the Month.</p>	
<p>Deputy Chief Monthly Reports as of May 30, 2019</p>	<p>Deputy Fire Chief Vaughan gave an overview of his Monthly Reports highlighting his meetings with the Ocean Safety Junior Lifeguard coordinators and representatives from the Hawai`i State Canoe Racing Association. He also provided an update on the Department`s strategic initiatives and goals.</p>	<p>Mr. Levinthol moved to receive the Deputy Chief`s Monthly Reports. Mr. Martinez seconded the motion. The motion carried 6:0.</p>
<p>BUSINESS KFC 2019-07</p>	<p><u>Discussion and decision-making on the Permitted Interaction Group (“PIG”) recommendations relating to the framing of language to use for the Fire Chief`s job description posting, length of the job posting and selection on advertisement venues and selection and determination on the number of criterias’.</u></p> <p>Chair Pacheco stated that at the June 3, 2019 meeting, the Permitted Interaction Group submitted recommendations and that the Commission needs to vote to either accept or not accept the Group`s recommendations.</p>	

SUBJECT	DISCUSSION	ACTION
	<p>Additionally, Boards and Commissions Administrator Ms. Ching has recommendation regarding the resumes that was brought to her attention by a member of the Police Commission which she would like to present to the body for consideration.</p> <p>Being there were no questions from the Commissioners, Chair Pacheco invited Ms. Ching to deliver her presentation.</p> <p>Ms. Ching stated that her suggestion stems from an issue that came up during a screening process of a particular commission to fill their top position. She explained that a lot of their resumes contained a lot of information, but there was one particular resume that contained twenty-five pages largely made up of photographs and training certificates. So, to help make the screening process to be more efficient and less cumbersome for the PIG, the Fire Commission might want to adopt a standard and stipulate in the Fire Chief’s job posting that resumes should include a cover letter, be no longer than five pages and a maximum of one page describing any training classes, degrees, letters of professional or personal references/recommendations, training certificates, diplomas, but no photographs will be accepted.</p> <p>Chair Pacheco stated that to his recollection, the staff in the Department of Human Resources put in a lot of hours to just put together the binders for each individual applicant and that he also remembers that the binders contained a lot of photographs, training certificates and professional and personal references.</p> <p>Ms. Ching stated that the intent is to scale down on how many documents an applicant can submit, but at the same time be able to get the relevant information which she believes will make the screening process be more efficient and coherent for the PIG. Then once, the Commission or the Group selects the candidates who will be moving forward to the next phase of the hiring process, they ask those candidates to submit any letters of recommendations, professional/personal references and training certificates.</p> <p>Mr. Martinez expressed his concerns about not being able to verify a person’s level of education and years of service and experience if the Group does not have the information from the beginning. To address, his concerns, Ms. Ching stated that to her understanding, the second Group (once established)</p>	

SUBJECT	DISCUSSION	ACTION
	<p>will be making a recommendation to include language in the Fire Chief’s job description to say “in lieu of a bachelor’s degree, years of experience as a Deputy Fire Chief, Assistant Fire Chief and Battalion Chief will be considered or in some cases both will be considered.</p> <p>Mr. Garces asked for clarification on whether the Group will be the ones screening all of the resumes and not HR. Ms. Ching stated that the matter will be addressed on another agendanized item.</p> <p>Chair Pacheco stated that in the first hiring process, the Commission asked HR to screen all of the resumes and to come up with a list showing which candidate met all six criterias or some of the criterias’s, and to his recollection there was two candidates who met all six criterias’; four candidates met five of the criterias’; six candidates met four of the criterias’ and so forth. Then from there, the Commission scaled the list down to fourteen candidates based on their individual scores and those fourteen were invited to do phone interviews.</p> <p>Mr. Martinez asked if years of experience/service was one of the six criterias’ to which Chair Pacheco replied that prior chief experience was one of the criterias’.</p> <p>Ms. Ching pointed out to the Commissioners that the second hiring process is going to be different from the first hiring process because the first hiring process the emphasis was placed on whether a candidate had a college degree. But in the second hiring process, in lieu of a college degree, years of experience as a deputy fire chief, assistant fire chief, and battalion chief will be considered.</p> <p>Chair Pacheco stated that to make things clear, he would like to take each individual recommendations and have the Commissioners either vote to accept or not accept the recommendation. Hearing no objections, Chair Pacheco invited Ms. Ching read each recommendation out loud starting with Recommendation No. 1 (a) through (c).</p> <p><u>Recommendation No. 1 – Amend Fire Chief’s Posting Notice to:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) In addition to the \$127,313 salary amount <u>include up to \$137,002 effective July 1, 2019</u>. Mr. Martinez moved to accept the PIG’s recommendation. Mr. Levinthol seconded, hearing no objections, the PIG’s recommendation was accepted. b) Eliminate paragraph 4 in it’s entirely. Mr. Martinez moved to accept the PIG’s recommendation. Mr. Levinthol seconded, hearing 	

SUBJECT	DISCUSSION	ACTION
	<p>No objections, the PIG’s recommendation was accepted.</p> <p>(c) In paragraph 6, strike out “day-to-day” and insert “<u>departments.</u>”</p> <p>Mr. Martinez moved to accept the PIG’s recommendation. Mr. Levinthol seconded. Hearing no objections, the PIG’s recommendation was accepted.</p> <p>Before continuing with the meeting, Mr. Garces asked Ms. Ching if she could to read paragraph four to which Ms. Ching read as follows: <i>“Additionally, knowledge of national, state and county fire codes, laws governing fire protection and fire suppression, principles of firefighting and fire organizational structures, structural firefighting and wild land firefighting techniques, land-based, airborne, and ocean rescue techniques, ocean safety and public safety guidelines, and federal, state and county laws and regulations is desired. Possession of a Bachelor’s degree in Fire Science, Fire Administration, Public or Business Administration, and the possession of a current certification as a Hazmat Incident Commander and Fire Officer IV, Executive Fire Officer Designee, or Fire Chief Designee are highly desirable.”</i></p> <p>Ms. Ching explained that by taking out paragraph four out and replacing it with years of experience versus having a bachelor’s degree will change the tenure of the Fire Chief’s job description and job posting. Mr. Garces thanked Ms. Ching for the clarification.</p> <p>Ms. Ching stated that striking out the term day-to-day and replacing with it <u>departments</u> would read- “In addition to managing the <u>Department</u>’s operations, the Fire Chief will be excepted to work with the Fire Commission and assist the Commission in the execution of its duties as described by the Charter of the County of Kaua‘i.”</p> <p>With no further comments or questions, Chair Pacheco moved on to Recommendation No. 2.</p>	

SUBJECT	DISCUSSION	ACTION
	<p><u>Recommendation No. 2 - Determine the length of the job posting with the various advertisement venues.</u></p> <p>Post the ad for 30 days with the following venues: Government (county, other counties, state) Garden Island Newspaper, Star Advertiser and other professional website organizations like the International Fire Chief's, Hawai'i Fire Chief's Association both HFCA and WECA, Indeed website and Midweek magazine. Ms. Ching specifically noted that the 30 days would start on the day HR is able to post the job opening because at this point of the hiring process no specific date has been determine. Mr. Garces asked a clarifying question on whether the job posting would be done internally to which Ms. Ching replied that the job posting will be posted on the County's website.</p> <p>With no further discussion, Chair Pacheco called for a motion to accept or reject Recommendation No. 2.</p>	<p>Ms. Chahanovich moved to accept Recommendation No. 2. Mr. Garces seconded the motion. The motion carried 6:0.</p>

SUBJECT	DISCUSSION	ACTION
	<p>Ms. Ching stated that <u>Recommendation No. 3</u> is in two-parts. 1) Keep the previous criterias' and 2) Amend the Fire Chief's job description to include the draft proposed language under <u>other desirable qualifications</u> as follows: "years of experience as an assistant fire chief, deputy fire chief, fire captain and battalion chief would be highly considered in lieu of bachelor's degree or both."</p> <p>Mr. Martinez made the motion accept the PIG's recommendation to amend the Fire Chief's job description. Mr. Levinthol seconded the motion.</p> <p>Ms. Ching asked Mr. Takamura if the PIG's recommendation to amend the Fire Chief's job description should be PIG No. 2 responsibility to which Mr. Takamura replied yes, and stated that the Commission should probably defer any action until the outcome of the PIG No. 2. He added that the purpose of establishing a second permitted interaction group is to investigate making changes to the Fire Chief's job description which would essentially affect the Fire Chief's job posting.</p> <p>Ms. Ching stated that based on Mr. Takamura's advice, the Commission should defer taking action on amending the Fire Chief's Job Description until after PIG No. 2 is established and is able to make a recommendation. However, the Commission could adopt the recommendation, but make it subject to the determination of PIG No. 2 regarding the Fire Chief's job description.</p> <p>Mr. Takamura stated that he recommends the Commission accept Ms. Ching's proposal, but make it subject to the outcome of PIG No. 2 that is going to be established today or the Commission could reject the recommendation and have the PIG No. 2 determine the outcome.</p> <p>Ms. Ching stated that it put simply, the Commission could adopt the recommendation to keep the previous criterias' and defer the matter regarding the Fire Chief's job description to the next PIG. Mr. Takamura noted that the any recommendations regarding the selection of criterias' should be for PIG No. 2 to handle, and then advised Mr. Martinez to withdraw his motion after someone seconds the motion.</p>	<p>Mr. Martinez moved not to adopt the recommendation to amend the Fire Chief's Job Description and defer the matter to the PIG No. 2 once it has been established.</p> <p><i>*Due to a lack of a second, the motion died.</i></p>

SUBJECT	DISCUSSION	ACTION
	<p>Ms. Ching stated that next order of business is for the Commission to decide whether it wants to adopt a standard procedure on how to receive resumes which will be included in the Fire Chief's job posting announcement. She explained that having a procedure in place would limit a resume to a cover letter, a maximum of five pages and a one page listing of any training classes, the resumes; however, would not include any personal or professional references, certificates, diplomas, letters of recommendation and photographs because those would be included later on, when the Commission gets to the semi-finalists phase.</p> <p>Mr. Martinez asked by excluding personal/professional references and relying just on a person's years of serve and experience (because a person does not have a college degree) how the Commission is supposed to verify whether a person has the experience or not.</p> <p>Ms. Ching explained that the standardize procedure would not prevent or exclude anyone from submitting personal and or professional references during the semi-finalists phase because at that point, the Commission would ask them to provide the necessary information to verify whether they have the experience or not. And as she stated earlier, her suggestion stems from the Police Commission's hiring process in that the resumes they received were unnecessarily lengthy. The assumption is when it comes time to verify the information a person puts in their resume and they cannot prove it – he or she would automatically be disqualified; and like she stated earlier, the most egregious resume the Police Commission received contained twenty-five pages and most of it consisted mainly of photographs.</p> <p>Mr. Martinez stated that if the Commission was to agree to keep the resumes to five pages maybe it could eliminate some of the other information.</p> <p>For all intent and purposes, Ms. Chahanovich pointed out that when it comes to submitting a resume a person should be able to sum up everything he or she had done in five pages and a cover letter.</p>	

SUBJECT	DISCUSSION	ACTION
	<p><u>Public Testimony</u></p> <p>Ms. Felicia Cowden stated that she has hired hundreds of people in her life time for much simpler positions, then a Fire Chief and that her instincts is in align with Mr. Martinez. She stated that applications that come electronically are normally be scanned, but if you see applications that is grossly inappropriate and contains twenty-five photos that resume should not get printed. It makes her nervous to think that the Commission is not going to ask information to back up a person’s resume and by cutting certain things off which to her does not make any sense and sounds like the main criteria is to make it easier by lessening the time rather than getting the best candidate. So, as a person who has hired many people, and as a citizen, it doesn’t give her any confidence that the Commission is going to be make the right choices when it comes to picking the more qualified candidates for the ones that are less then.</p> <p>Ms. Ching stated that the Police Commission went through a very long hiring process from reviewing applications to conducting background checks and psychological exams to find the right person for the Chief of Police position. So, the suggestion that she is proposing is not to save the Commission time in reviewing the resumes it is to make the screening process to be more efficient and less cumbersome, but at the same time be able to get all of the necessary information, the Commission will need to make the right decision. She added that although in the first step the Commission would not call for the information, the second or third phase of the hiring process would cover that.</p> <p>Ms. Cowden stated that she commends the Police Commissioners for all of their hard work to find the right person for the job. She added that the Fire Chief’s position is going to attract a lot of qualified candidates both local and from the mainland, but when it comes time to look at the candidates from the mainland it may not be easy for the Commission to find the right person without the information. In ending, she stated that she supports Mr. Martinez concerns.</p> <p>Being there were no further testimony, Chair Pacheco called for a motion to accept, reject or amend Ms. Ching’s proposed recommendation.</p> <p>After the motion was seconded by Mr. Levinthol, Chair Pacheco asked the Commissioners if they wanted to have more discussion on the matter.</p>	<p>Mr. Martinez moved to not accept Ms. Ching’s proposed recommendation. Mr. Levinthol seconded the motion.</p>

SUBJECT	DISCUSSION	ACTION
	<p>Ms. Chahanovich asked if the motion on the floor is to not accept Ms. Ching’s recommendation to limit the resumes to five pages to which Chair Pacheco replied yes. Vice Chair Iwamoto asked if the initial round of applicants would be able to provide photographs and as much history as they want too or not. Ms. Ching stated that the Commissioners would to state specifically what it wants to do in regard to the resumes otherwise the process would remain status quo which would make it harder to compare. Chair Pacheco stated that the motion on the floor is to not accept Ms. Ching’s recommendation. Mr. Martinez stated that the reason he made the motion is because he does not want the Commission to lose anyone without being able to vet them first. He added that the motion can always be amended later to just five pages of resumes or whatever the Commission wants to do.</p> <p>Mr. Garces stated that like Ms. Chahanovich five pages of resume should be sufficient because being direct and to the point is the way to go, besides he doesn’t want to have to review pages and pages of a person’s resume.</p> <p>Mr. Levinthol stated that he agrees with Mr. Garces, but at the same time if a person wants to submit five pages or more, at the end of the day it will be up to the Commission to decide if its wants to eliminate or keep the person.</p> <p>With no further discussion, Chair Pacheco called for a Roll Call vote.</p> <p>Commissioner Chahanovich – Nay Commissioner Alfredo Garces Jr. – Nay Commissioner Levinthol - Aye Commissioner Martinez – Aye Vice Chair Iwamoto- Aye Chair Pacheco – Nay The motion failed by a tie vote of 3:3.</p> <p>Ms. Ching stated that after listening to the discussion there seems to be concerns about limiting the amount of information a person can submit in their resumes so in her effort to get a consensus amongst the Commission perhaps, each individual Commissioner could provide some of their own</p>	

SUBJECT	DISCUSSION	ACTION
	<p>input and still make the screening process less cumbersome. Mr. Martinez stated that he will agree with the recommendation, but he's just concern about eliminating any personal and professional references because when it comes to verifying a person's credential's having those references on hand is important to the hiring process.</p> <p>After going back and forth, the Commissioners came to a consensus on the type of information a resume should contain. The resumes be no more than five pages and be limited to one page of training (education) classes, a cover letter and no more than five pages of personal/professional references and letters of recommendation and absolutely no photographs.</p> <p>With no further discussion, Chair Pacheco called for a motion.</p>	<p>Mr. Levinthol moved to accept Ms. Ching's recommendation as amended. Mr. Martinez seconded. The motion carried 6:0.</p> <p>With no further tasks, the Permitted Interaction Group was dissolved.</p>
<p>KFC 2019-08</p>	<p><u>Discussion and decision-making on establishing a Permitted Interaction Group (PIG). The purpose of establishing a PIG would be for the hiring of a new Fire Chief and that the Commission will define the scope of the PIG and each individual's authority to investigate the Fire Chief's job description and present its recommendations to the body at a subsequent meeting which would amend the Fire Chief's job description as it relates to other desirable qualifications.</u></p> <p>Chair Pacheco opened the matter up for discussion.</p> <p>Ms. Ching stated that the purpose of establishing a new Permitted Interaction Group is to amend the language in the Fire Chief's job description to years of experience as a Fire Chief, Deputy Fire Chief, Fire Captain and Battalion Chief will be highly considered in lieu of a college degree.</p> <p>Mr. Martinez stated that he would be in favor of establishing a PIG with the same individuals which consisted of Commissioners Iwamoto, Nizo and himself.</p>	<p>Ms. Chahanovich moved to establish PIG No. 1 consisting of Commissioners Iwamoto, Martinez and Nizo to investigate amending the Fire Chief's job description. Mr. Garces seconded. The motion carried 6:0.</p>
<p>KFC 2019-09</p>	<p><u>Discussion and decision-making on establishing a second Permitted Interaction Group (PIG). The purpose of establishing a second PIG would be for the hiring of a new Fire Chief and that the Commission will define the scope of the PIG and each individual's authority which may include review/screening of applications and make recommendations to the body at a subsequent meeting on the selection of semi-finalists.</u></p>	<p>Mr. Martinez moved to establish PIG No. 2 consisting of the same members to review the applications and develop a tool that each member would use to review the applications once PIG No.</p>

SUBJECT	DISCUSSION	ACTION
	Chair Pacheco opened the matter up for discussion. Ms. Ching explained that PIG No. 2 would be responsible to review the applications and develop a tool that each person would use to review the applications.	1 has completed its task. Mr. Levinthol seconded the motion. The motion carried 6:0.
KFC 2019-10	<p><u>Discussion and decision-making on establishing a third Permitted Interaction Group. The purpose of establishing a third PIG would be for the hiring of a new Fire Chief and that the Commission will define the scope of the PIG and each individual's authority which may include framing and vetting written and oral questions for the candidates and make recommendations to the body at a subsequent meeting.</u></p> <p>Chair Pacheco opened the matter up for discussion. Hearing no discussion, Chair Pacheco called for a motion.</p>	Mr. Martinez moved to establish PIG No. 3 consisting of the same members to frame and vet written and oral questions for the candidates once PIG No. 2 has completed its task. Mr. Levinthol seconded the motion. The motion carried 6:0.
Executive Session KFC 2018-002	Pursuant to Hawai'i Revised Statutes §92-4 and §92-5 (a) and (2) and (4), the purpose of this Executive Session is for the Commission to discuss the hiring of a new Fire Chief and other related matters where consideration of matters affecting privacy will be involved, and to consult with its attorney on questions and issues pertaining to the Commission's powers, duties, privileges, immunities and liabilities as they may relate to this agenda item. (On-going)	There was no Executive Session.
Adjournment	With no further business to conduct, Chair Pacheco called for a motion to adjourn the meeting.	Mr. Garces moved to adjourn the meeting. Ms. Chahanovich seconded the motion. The motion carried 6:0. At 3:25 p.m. the meeting adjourned.

Submitted by: _____

Mercedes Omo, Staff Support Clerk

Reviewed and Approved by: _____

Chad Pacheco, Chair

() Approved as circulated on August 12, 2019

() Approved as amended. See minutes of _____ meeting.